

Online Appendix A: Examples of Control Variables in the Pay Equity Literature

Regular salary equity studies can be a best practice among employers committed to salary equity and fairly managed compensation. As discussed in a forthcoming article entitled “How to do a salary equity study – With an illustrative example from higher education,” by Lori L. Taylor, Joanna N. Lahey, Molly I. Beck, and Jeffrey E. Froyd, salary equity studies typically use regression techniques to model the relationship between a measure of compensation, a demographic of interest (such as sex or race), and an array of other possible explanatory factors, which are referred to as controls. Controls included in the salary analysis help rule out alternative explanations for the patterns in the data. The table below highlights several examples from the salary equity literature and describes the controls used therein.

Table A1: Examples of Control Variables in the Pay Equity Literature, by Demographic of Interest and Data Type

Article	Demographics of Interest	Controls	Administrative or Survey Data?
Albaek et al. (2017)	Sex	Years of education; experience; tenure; residence in capital; living with partner	Administrative
Alkadry et al. (2017)	Sex	Authority profile (total annual revenue of city, number of FTEs, city population), cost of living (median gross rent), population income (median income)	Administrative
Alkadry and Tower (2006)	Sex	Position classification; certification; years of experience; current job tenure; number of subordinates; years of education; age; organizational size; hierarchical distance from the CEO; cost of living and labor market competitiveness	Survey
Alkadry and Tower (2011)	Sex	Experience, # of subordinates, certifications, # of levels between Respondent and the top procurement officer, annual procurement	Survey

		volume (under purchasing), age of respondent, number of employees at the agency, median rent in county, race, education level	
Bacolod and Blum (2010)	Sex	Experience, race, educational attainment, location, occupational requirements (motor skills, cognitive skills, people skills, physical strength).	Survey
Barbezat (2004)	Sex	Experience, administrative responsibilities, advance degree, department, position, seniority, productivity, rank	Survey
Bidwell (2011)	Loyalty	Experience (calculated from age and educational attainment); sex; race; educational attainment; worker performance; rank; functional unit; department; location; proportion of new hires and turnover in the unit.	Administrative
Binder et al. (2010)	Sex	Experience; administrative responsibilities (within department and at university level); education; department; rank; productivity; # of years at university; job mobility factors	Administrative
Blackaby et al. (2005)	Sex	Ethnicity; age; marital status; productivity (research grant income (binned); self-reported teaching assessment; publications score); workplace characteristics (London; quality of department;); undergraduate degree; first class degree; labor market experience (external; career break; non-academic experience); rank	Survey
Blau and Kahn (2016)	Sex	Education (years and categorical variables); experience; experience ² ; race/ethnicity; region; and metropolitan area residence; industry; occupation; and union coverage dummy variables;	Survey

Bradley, Green, and Managan (2015)	Sex	Ethnicity; indigenous person; age; tenure; occupation; educational attainment (for a subset of employees); health characteristics; language minority background; agency where employed	Administrative
Carlin et al. (2013)	Sex	Experience; education; age; labor market competitiveness; department/agency; position/rank; productivity; # of years at university	Administrative
Fairweather (2005)	Sex and Race	Education; years since highest degree; length of contract; hours spent in the classroom per week; type of students taught; instructional strategy; total refereed publications; principal investigator indicator; department chair indicator; program area; employer characteristics (public/private; institutional wealth; Carnegie typology)	Survey
Ginther (2003)	Sex	Tenure; rank; education; department/agency; # of publications; # of papers presented; primary work activity; marital status; number of children; years of experience; employer characteristics (public/private; liberal arts or doctoral institution; Carnegie ranking)	Survey
Ginther and Hayes (2001)	Sex	Cross-section: age; race; nativity; marital status; number of children; experience; experience2; type of PhD-granting institution; rank; tenure status; institution; work activity; productivity (average productivity); field; panel: yrs to promotion; tenure status; age in 1995; nativity; proportion of yrs married; number of children; work experience in 1995; proportion of career in a certain type of institution; proportion of primary work activity; proportion of time spent unranked/unemployed/non-academic; productivity(average); field of study	Survey

Kenyon (1997)	Sex	Number of years working as a social worker, number of years since completing a master of social work (if applicable); age; primary practice field; employment status; level of education	Survey
Kenyon (2003)	Sex	Employment status; education level; years of social work; work function; total time missed from work; work interruption for child/family; work interruption for education; job changes; living with spouse/partner and children	Survey
Lewis (2018)	Sex and Race	Education; age; state of employment; hours worked in a typical week	Survey
Lewis, Boyd and Pathak (2018)	Sex and Race	Education; age; hours worked; citizenship status; English fluency; veteran status; occupation; college major; state of employment	Survey
Meier and Wilkins (2002)	Sex	Budget size; local revenue percent; years of experience; age; current job tenure; doctorate; prior performance; race	Administrative
Miller (2009)	Sex	Years of education; potential labor market experience; experience2; marital status; resident of a Southern state; racial origin; LOTE at home; binary for whether a language other than English was spoken at home; presence of young children; family income; number of siblings; father's occupation level; parents' educational attainment.	
Pudney and Shields (2000)	Sex and Race	Educational attainment; number of career breaks; number of additional trainings; total time as non-NHS nurse; overseas or private nursing experience; part-time or full-time; race/ethnicity; gender; marital status	Survey

Renzulli et al. (2013)	Sex	Gender; institution-type; academic division; rank; teaching and research responsibilities; productivity; professional age in years; administrator status; race	Survey
Sneed (2007)	Sex	Job function categories (distributive, regulatory, redistributive, financial administration and general control)	Administrative
Webber and Gonzalez-Canché (2015)	Sex and Race	Gender; race; "level and type of doctorate-granting" institution; sector of employment; field of study; time to degree; years since graduation; marital status	Survey

References

- Albæk, K., Larsen, M., & Thomsen, L. S. (2017). Segregation and gender wage gaps in the private and the public sectors: an analysis of Danish linked employer–employee data, 2002–2012. *Empirical Economics*, 53(2), 779-802.
- Alkadry, M. G., Bishu, S. G., & Ali, S.B. (2017). Beyond representation: Gender, authority, and city managers. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 1-20. doi:10.1177/0734371X17718030
- Alkadry, M. G., & Tower, L. E. (2006). Unequal pay: The role of gender. *Public Administration Review*, 66(6), 888-898. doi:10.1111/j.1540-6210.2006.00656.x
- Alkadry, M. G., & Tower, L. E. (2011). Covert pay discrimination: How authority predicts pay differences between women and men. *Public Administration Review*, 71(5), 740-750. doi:10.1111/j.1540-6210.2011.02413.x
- Bacolod, M. P., & Blum, B. S. (2010). Two sides of the same coin: US “residual” inequality and the gender gap. *Journal of Human Resources*, 45(1), 197-242. doi:10.3368/jhr.45.1.197
- Barbezat, D. A. (2004). A loyalty tax? National measures of academic salary compression. *Research in Higher Education*, 45(7), 761-776. doi:10.1023/B:RIHE.0000044230.25883.46
- Bidwell, M. (2011). Paying more to get less. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 56(3), 369-407. doi:10.1177/0001839211433562
- Binder, M., Krause, K., Chermak, J., Thacher, J., & Gilroy, J. (2010). Same work, different pay? Evidence from a US public university. *Feminist Economics*, 16(4), 105-135. doi: 10.1080/13545701.2010.530605
- Blau, F. D., & Kahn, L. M. (2017). The gender wage gap: Extent, trends, and explanations. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 55(3), 789-865. doi:10.1257/jel.20160995
- Bradley, S., Green, C., & Mangan, J. (2015). Gender wage gaps within a public sector: Evidence from personnel data. *The Manchester School*, 83(4), 379-397. doi:10.1111/manc.12061.

- Bradley, S., Green, C., & Mangan, J. (2015). Gender wage gaps within a public sector: Evidence from personnel data. *The Manchester School*, 83(4), 379-397. doi: 10.1111/manc.12061
- Carlin, P. S., Kidd, M. P., Rooney, P. M., & Denton, B. (2013). Academic wage structure by gender: The roles of peer review, performance, and market forces. *Southern Economic Journal*, 80(1), 127-146. doi:10.4284/0038-4038-2010.267
- Fairweather, J. S. (2005). Beyond the rhetoric: Trends in the relative value of teaching and research in faculty salaries. *The Journal of Higher Education*, 76(4), 401-422. doi: 10.1080/00221546.2005.11772290
- Ginther, D. K. (2003). Is MIT an exception? Gender pay differences in academic science. *Bulletin of Science Technology & Society*, 23(1), 21-26. doi:10.1177/0270467602239767
- Ginther, D. K., & Hayes, K. J. (2003). Gender differences in salary and promotion for faculty in the humanities 1977-1995. *The Journal of Human Resources*, 38(1), 34-73. doi: 10.3368/jhr.XXXVIII.1.34
- Kenyon, G.L. (1997). Gender and income among Ontario social workers: The source of disparity. *Canadian Social Work Review*, 14(2), 155 – 166.
- Kenyon, G.L. (2003). Why does he always get to be the boy? Examining the gender income gap in social work. *Canadian Social Work Review*, 20 (2), 185 – 202.
- Lewis, G.B. (2018). Diversity, pay equity, and pay in social work and other professions. *Affilia: Journal of Women and Social Work*, 33 (3), 286-299. DOI: 10.1177/0886109917747615
- Lewis, G. B., Boyd, J., & Pathak, R. (2018) Progress toward pay equity in state governments? *Public Administration Review*. 78(3), 386-397. doi:10.1111/puar.12897
- Meier, K. J., & Wilkins, V. M. (2002). Gender differences in agency head salaries: The case of public education. *Public Administration Review*, 62(4), 405-411. doi:10.1111/0033-3352.00194

- Miller, P. W. (2009). The gender pay gap in the US: Does sector make a difference? *Journal of Labor Research*, 30(1), 52-74. doi:10.1007/s12122-008-9050-5
- Pudney, S., & Shields, M. (2000). Gender, race, pay and promotion in the British nursing profession: estimation of a generalized ordered probit model. *Journal of Applied Econometrics*, 15(4), 367-399.
- Renzulli, L. A., Reynolds, J., Kelly, K., & Grant, L. (2013). Pathways to gender inequality in faculty pay: the impact of institution, academic division, and rank. *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, 34(2013, December), 58-72. doi: /10.1016/j.rssm.2013.08.004
- Sneed, B. G. (2007). Glass walls in state bureaucracies: Examining the difference departmental function can make. *Public Administration Review*, 67(5), 880-891. doi:10.1111/j.1540-6210.2007.00775.x
- Webber, K. L., & González Canché, M. (2015). Not equal for all: Gender and race differences in salary for doctoral degree recipients. *Research in Higher Education*, 56(7), 645-672. doi: 10.1007/s11162-015-9369-8